On a Kinetic Origin of Heredity: Minority Control in a Replicating System with Mutually Catalytic Molecules

KUNIHIKO KANEKO*† AND TETSUYA YOMO‡

*Department of Pure and Applied Sciences, University of Tokyo, Komaba, Meguro-ku, Tokyo 153, Japan and ‡Department of Biotechnology, Faculty of Engineering, Osaka University, 2-1 Suita, Osaka 565, Japan

(Received on 2 May 2001, Accepted in revised form on 12 October 2001)

As the first step in an investigation of the origin of genetic information, we study how some species of molecules are preserved over cell generations and play an important role in controlling the growth of a cell. We consider a model consisting of protocells. Each protocell contains two mutually catalysing molecule species (X and Y), each of which has catalytically active and inactive types. One of the species Y is assumed to have a slower synthesis speed. Through divisions of the protocells, the system reaches and remains in a state in which there are only a few active Y and almost no inactive Y molecules in most protocells, through the selection of very rare fluctuations. In this state, the active Y molecules are shown to control the behavior of the protocell. The minority molecule species act as the carrier of heredity, due to the relatively discrete nature of its population, in comparison with the majority species which behaves statistically in accordance with the law of large numbers. The minority controlled state may give rise to a selection pressure for mechanisms that ensure the transmission of the minority molecule. Once those mechanisms are in place, the minority molecule becomes the ideal storage device for information to be transmitted across generations, thus giving rise to "genetic information". The relevance of this minority controlled state to evolvability is also discussed.

© 2002 Elsevier Science Ltd

1. Introduction

The origin of genetic information in a replicating system is an important theoretical topic that should be studied, not necessarily as a property of certain molecules, but as a general property of replicating systems. Consider a simple prototype cell that consists of mutually catalysing molecule species whose intra-cellular population growth results in cell reproduction. In this protocell, the molecules that carry the genetic information are not initially specified, and to realize the growth in molecule numbers alone, it may not be necessary for specific molecules carrying such information to exist.

In actual cells, however, it is generally believed that information is encoded in DNA, which controls the behavior of a cell. With regard to this point, though it is not necessary to take a strong "geno-centric" standpoint, it cannot be denied that there exists a difference between DNA and protein molecules in the role of information carrier. Still, even in actual cells, proteins and DNA both possess catalytic ability, and catalyse the production of each other, leading to

† Author to whom correspondence should be addressed.

© 2002 Elsevier Science Ltd
cell replication. Then, why is DNA regarded as the carrier of information?

To investigate this problem we need to clarify what information means. In considering information, one often tends to be interested in how several messages are encoded on a molecule. In fact, a heteropolymer such as DNA would be suited to encode many bits of information. Although this "combinatorial" capacity of an information carrier is important, here we are interested in a problem that has to be satisfied prior to that. This problem is the origin of heredity. The heredity is what causes a statistical correlation in phenotype between ancestor and offspring. To understand the origin of genetic information, one needs to understand as to how a molecule starts to govern this heredity. For a molecule to carry heredity, we identify the following two features as necessary:

1) If this molecule is removed or replaced by a mutant, there is a strong influence on the behavior of the cell. We refer to this as the "control property".

2) Such molecules are preserved well over generations. The number of such molecules exhibits smaller fluctuations than that of other molecules, and their chemical structure (such as polymer sequence) is preserved over a long time span, even under potential changes by fluctuations through the synthesis of these molecules. We refer to this as the "preservation property".

These two conditions are regarded as a fundamental condition for a molecule to establish the heredity. Here, we first study how a molecule starts to have the above two properties in a protocol. In other words, we study the problem of "information" at a minimal level, i.e. how 1-bit information starts to be encoded on a single molecule in a replicating cell systems. Later, we will discuss how a protocol with the heredity in the above sense attains incentive to evolve genetic information in today's sense.

According to the present understanding of molecular biology Albert et al. (1994), changes undergone by DNA molecules are believed to exercise stronger influences on the behavior of cells than other chemicals. With a higher catalytic activity, a DNA molecule has a stronger influence on the behavior of a cell. Also, a DNA molecule is transferred to offspring cells relatively accurately, compared with other constituents of the cell. Hence, a DNA molecule satisfies (at least) properties (1) and (2).

In addition, a DNA molecule is stable, and the time scale for the change of DNA, e.g. its replication process as well as its destruction process, is slower. Because of this relatively slow replication, the number of DNA molecules is smaller than the number of protein molecules. For one generation of cells, a single replication of each DNA molecule occurs typically, while other molecules undergo more replications (and decompositions).

The question we address in the present paper is as follows. Consider a protocol with mutually catalysing molecules. Then, under what conditions, does one molecule species begin to satisfy conditions (1) and (2) so that the molecule carries heredity? We show, under rather general conditions in our model of a mutually catalysing system, that a symmetry breaking between the two kinds of molecules takes place, and through replication and selection, one kind of molecule comes to satisfy conditions (1) and (2).

Without assuming the detailed biochemical properties of DNA, we seek a general condition for the differentiation of the roles of molecules in a cell and study the origin of the controlling behavior of some molecules. Assuming only a difference in the synthesis rates of the two kinds of molecules, we show that the species that eventually possesses a smaller population satisfies (1) and (2) and plays an essential role to realize heredity. With this approach, we discuss the origin of heredity from a kinetic viewpoint.

In the present paper, we consider a very simple protocol system (see Fig. 1), consisting of two species of replicating molecules that catalyse each other. Each species has active and inactive molecule types, with only the active types of one species catalysing the replication of the other species for the replication. The rate of replication is different for the two species. We consider the behavior of a system with such mutually catalysing molecules with different replication speeds,
of chemicals available to the cell, these molecules replicate through catalytic reactions, so that their numbers within a cell increase. When the total number of molecules exceeds a given threshold, the cell divides into two, with each daughter cell inheriting half of the molecules of the mother, chosen randomly. Regarding the chemical species and the reaction, we make the following simplifying assumptions:

(i) There are two species of molecules, $X$ and $Y$, which are mutually catalysing.

(ii) For each species, there are active ($A$) and inactive ($I$) types. There are thus four types, $X^A$, $X^I$, $Y^A$, and $Y^I$. The active type has the ability to catalyse the replication of both types of the other species of molecules. The catalytic reactions for replication are assumed to take the form:

$$X^J + Y^A \rightarrow 2X^J + Y^A \quad \text{(for } J = A \text{ or } I)$$

and

$$Y^J + X^A \rightarrow 2Y^J + X^A \quad \text{(for } J = A \text{ or } I).$$

(iii) The rates of synthesis (or catalytic activity) of the molecules $X$ and $Y$ differ. We stipulate that the rate of the above replication process for $Y$, $\gamma_Y$, is much smaller than that for $X$, $\gamma_X$. This difference in the rates may also be caused by a difference in catalytic activities between the two molecule species.

(iv) It is natural to assume that the active molecule type is rather rare. With this in mind, we assume that there are $F$ types of inactive molecules per active type. For most simulations, we consider the case in which there is only one type of active molecules for each species.

(v) In the replication process, there may occur structural changes that alter the activity of molecules. Therefore, the type (active or inactive) of a daughter molecule can differ from that of the mother. The rate of such structural change is given by $\mu$, which is not necessarily small, due to thermodynamic fluctuations. This change can consist of the alternation of a sequence in a polymer or other conformational change, and may be regarded as replication "error". Note that the

\[\|\text{More precisely, there is a supply of precursor molecules for the synthesis of } X \text{ and } Y, \text{ and the replication occurs with the catalytic influence of either } X^A \text{ or } Y^A.\]
probability for the loss of activity is $F$ times greater than for its gain, since there are $F$ times more types of inactive molecules than active molecules. Hence, there are processes described by

$$X' \rightarrow X^A \quad \text{and} \quad Y' \rightarrow Y^A \quad (\text{with rate } \mu),$$

$$X^A \rightarrow X' \quad \text{and} \quad Y^A \rightarrow Y' \quad (\text{with rate } \mu F),$$

resulting from structural change.

(vi) When the total number of molecules in a protocol exceeds a given value $2N$, it divides into two, and the chemicals therein are distributed to the two daughter cells randomly, with $N$ molecules going to each. Subsequently, the total number of molecules in each daughter cell increases from $N$ to $2N$, at which point these divide.

(vii) To include competition, we assume that there is a constant total number $M_{\text{tot}}$ of protocols, so that one protocol, randomly chosen, is removed whenever a (different) protocol divides into two.

In the above-described process, we have basically four sets of parameters: the ratio of synthesis rates $\gamma_1 / \gamma_2$, the error rate $\mu$, the fraction of active molecules $1/F$, and the number of molecules $N$. (The number $M_{\text{tot}}$ is not important, as long as it is not too small.)

We carried out the simulation of this model, according to the following procedure. First, a pair of molecules is chosen randomly. If these molecules are of different species, then if the $X$ molecule is active, a new $Y$ molecule is produced with the probability $\gamma_2$, and if the $Y$ molecule is active, a new $X$ molecule is produced with the probability $\gamma_1$. Such replications occur with the error rates given above. All the simulations were thus carried out stochastically, in this manner.

We consider a stochastic model rather than the corresponding rate equation, which is valid for large $N$, since we are interested in the case with relatively small $N$. This follows from the fact that in a cell, often the number of molecules of a given species is not large, and thus the continuum limit implied in the rate equation approach is not necessarily justified (Hess & Mikhailov 1994, 1995; Stange et al., 1998). Furthermore, it has recently been found that the discrete nature of a molecule population leads to qualitatively different behavior than in the continuum case in a simple autocatalytic reaction network (Togashi & Kaneko, 2001).

3. Result

If $N$ is very large, the above-described stochastic model can be replaced by a continuous model given by the rate equation. Then, the growth dynamics of the number of molecules $N_x^j$ and $N_y^j$ (for $J = A$ or $I$) is described by the rate equations

$$\frac{dN_x^j}{dt} = \gamma_1 N_x^j N_y^j - \gamma_2 N_y^j N_x^j, \quad \frac{dN_y^j}{dt} = \gamma_2 N_x^j N_y^j - \gamma_1 N_y^j N_x^j.$$  (1)

From these equations, under repeated divisions, it is expected that the relations $N_x^j / N_y^j = \gamma_1 / \gamma_2$, $N_x^j / N_y^j = 1/F$, and $N_x^j / N_y^j = 1/F$ are eventually satisfied. Indeed, even with our stochastic simulation, this number distribution is approached as $N$ is increased.

However, when $N$ is small, and with the selection process, there appears a significant deviation from the above distribution. In Fig. 2, we have plotted the average numbers $\langle N_x^j \rangle$, $\langle N_y^j \rangle$, $\langle N_x^4 \rangle$, and $\langle N_y^4 \rangle$. Here, $\langle \ldots \rangle$ represents the average over time of the number of the molecules of the individual species, existing in a cell just prior to the

![Fig. 2. Dependence of $\langle N_x^j \rangle$, $\langle N_y^j \rangle$, $\langle N_x^4 \rangle$, and $\langle N_y^4 \rangle$ on $N$. The parameters were fixed as $\gamma_1 = 1$, $\gamma_2 = 0.01$, and $\mu = 0.05$. The averages of $N_x^j$, $N_y^j$, $N_x^4$, and $N_y^4$ at the division event are plotted, and thus their sum is $2N$. In all the simulations conducted for the present paper, we used $M_{\text{tot}} = 100$, and the sampling for the averages were taken over $10^3 - 3 \times 10^4$ steps, where the number of divisions ranges from $10^3$ to $10^5$, depending on the parameters.](image-url)
division, when the total number of molecules is $2N$, averaged over all observed divisions throughout the system. (Accordingly, a cell removed without division does not contribute to the average.) As shown in the figure, there appears a state satisfying $\langle N_t^A \rangle \approx 2 - 10$, $\langle N_t^I \rangle \approx 0$. Since $F \gg 1$, such a state with $\langle N_t^A \rangle / \langle N_t^I \rangle > 1$ is not expected from the rate equation (1). Indeed, for the $X$-species, the number of inactive molecules is much larger than the number of active ones. Hence, we have found a novel state that can be realized due to the smallness of the number of molecules and the selection process.

In Fig. 2, $\gamma_x/\gamma_s$ and $F$ are fixed to 0.01 and 64, respectively, while the dependence of $\langle N_t^A \rangle$, $\langle N_t^I \rangle$, $\langle N_t^A \rangle / \langle N_t^I \rangle$ on these parameters is plotted in Figs 3 and 4. As shown in these figures, the above-mentioned state with $\langle N_t^A \rangle \approx 2 - 10$, $\langle N_t^I \rangle < 1$ is reached and sustained when $\gamma_x/\gamma_s$ is small and $F$ is sufficiently large. In fact, for most dividing cells, $N_t^I$ is exactly 0, while there appear a few cells with $N_t^I > 1$ from time to time. It should be noted that the state with almost no inactive $X$ molecules appears in the case of larger $F$, i.e., in the case of a larger possible variety of inactive molecules. This suppression of $Y_t^I$ for large $F$ contrasts with the behavior found in the continuum limit (the rate equation). In Fig. 5, we have plotted $\langle N_t^A \rangle / \langle N_t^I \rangle$ as a function of $F$. Up to some value of $F$, the proportion of active $X$ molecules decreases, in agreement with the naive expectation provided by eqn (1), but this proportion increases with further increase of $F$, in the case where $\gamma_x/\gamma_s$ is small ($\leq 0.02$) and $N$ is small.

This behavior of the molecular populations can be understood from the viewpoint of selection: in a system with mutual catalysis, both $X^A$ and $Y^A$ are necessary for the replication of protocells to continue. The number of $Y$ molecules is expected to be rather small, since their synthesis speed is much slower than that of $X$ molecules. Indeed, the fixed point distribution given by the continuum limit equations possesses a rather small $N_t^A$. In fact, when the total number of molecules is sufficiently small, the value of $\langle N_t^A \rangle$ given by these equations is $< 1$. However, in a system with mutual catalysis, both $X^A$ and $Y^A$ must be present for the replication of protocells to continue. In particular, for the replication of $X$ molecules to continue, at least a single active $Y$ molecule is necessary. Hence, if $N_t^A$ vanishes, only the replication of inactive $Y$ molecules occurs. For this reason, divisions producing descendants of this cell cannot proceed indefinitely, because the number of $X^A$ molecules is cut in half at each division. Thus, a cell with $N_t^A < 1$ cannot leave a continuing line of descendant cells. Also, for a cell with $N_t^A = 1$, only one of its daughter cells can have an active $Y$ molecule. Hence, a cell with $N_t^A = 1$ has no potentiality to multiply through division, and for this reason, given the presence of cells with $N_t^A > 1$ and selection, the
number of cells with $N^X_Y = 1$ should decrease with time. We thus see that over a sufficiently long time, protocells with $N^Y_Y > 1$ are selected.

The total number of $Y$ molecules is limited to small values, due to their slow synthesis speed. This implies that a cell that suppresses the number of $Y'$ molecules to be as small as possible is preferable under selection, so that there is room for $Y^A$ molecules. Hence, a state with almost no $Y'$ molecules and a few $Y^A$ molecules, once realized through fluctuations, is expected to be selected through competition for survival.

Of course, the fluctuations necessary to produce such a state decrease quite rapidly as the total molecule number increases, and for sufficiently large numbers, the continuum description of the rate equation is valid. Clearly then, a state of the type described above is selected only when the total number of molecules within a protocell is not too large. In fact, a state with very small $N^Y_Y$ appears only if the total number $N$ is smaller than some threshold value depending of $F$ and $\gamma_Y$ (Fig. 5).

To summarize our result, we have found that a state with a few active $Y$ molecules and very small number of inactive $Y$ molecules is selected if the replication of $Y$ molecules is much slower than that of $X$, a large variety of inactive molecules exists, and the total number of molecules is sufficiently small.

**Remark.** In the model considered here, we have included a mechanism for the synthesis of molecules, but not for their decomposition. To investigate the effect of the decomposition of molecules, we have also studied a model including a process to remove molecules randomly at some rate. We found that the above-stated conclusion is not altered by the inclusion of this mechanism.

### 4. Minority Controlled State

In Section 3, we showed that in a mutually catalysing replication system, the selected state is one in which the number of inactive molecules of the slower replicating species, $Y$, is drastically suppressed. In this section, we first show that the fluctuations of the number of active $Y$ molecules is smaller than those of active $X$ molecule in this state. Next, we show that the molecule species $Y$ (the minority species) becomes dominant in determining the growth speed of the (proto)cell system. Then, considering a model with several active molecule types, the control of chemical composition through specificity symmetry breaking is demonstrated.

#### 4.1. Control of the Growth Speed

First, we computed the time evolution of the number of active $X$ and $Y$ molecules, to see if the selection process acts more strongly to control the number of one or the other. We computed $N^X_Y$ and $N^Y_Y$ at every division to obtain the histograms of cells with given numbers of active molecules. [Here, the values of $N^X_Y$ were coarse-grained into bins of size 10, chosen as $[0, 10]$, $[10, 20]$, ..., while all possible values of $N^X_Y$, 1, 2, ..., were computed separately]. The histograms for $N^X_Y$ and $N^Y_Y$ were computed independently.

The histograms are plotted in Fig. 6(a). We see that the distribution for $N^X_Y$ has a sharp peak near $N^X_Y = 2$, while that for $N^Y_Y$ is much wider. Since the root mean square of a distribution increases with the square root of the average for a standard random process, we have plotted the histograms by rescaling the ordinate by the expected average of $\sqrt{N^X_Y / N^A}$, which is approximately 10. Even after this rescaling, we find that the distribution of $N^X_Y$ is much wider than that of $N^Y_Y$. Hence, the...
divisions, we record \( N^A_x \) and \( N^A_y \) to determine the time required for division \( T_d \). The division speed for a given \( N^A_y \) is computed as the division time for this value of \( N^A_y \) (with the bin size used for the histogram), averaged over all values of \( N^A_x \), and similarly for given \( N^A_x \). In Fig. 6(b), these average division times are plotted as functions of \( N^A_x \) and \( N^A_y \).

As shown in the figure, the division time is a much more rapidly decreasing function of \( N^A_y \) than of \( N^A_x \). We see that even a slight change in the number of active \( Y \) molecules has a strong influence on the division time of the cell. Of course, the growth rate also depends on \( N^A_x \), but this dependence is much weaker. Hence, the growth speed is controlled mainly by the active \( Y \) molecules.

In addition, the fluctuations around this average division time are smaller for fixed \( N^A_y \). To show this, we have computed the variance for \( T_d^2 (N^A_x) \) and \( T_d^2 (N^A_y) \). Considering that the variance typically increases in proportion to the corresponding average, we rescaled each variance by dividing by the corresponding average \( T_d^2 (N^A_x) \) or \( T_d^2 (N^A_y) \). This scaled variance takes values of around 0.55 for \( T_d^2 (N^A_y) \), and around 0.25 for \( T_d^2 (N^A_x) \). We thus conclude that the fluctuations of \( T_d (N^A_y) \) for fixed \( N^A_x \) are smaller. This implies that if \( N^A_y \) is fixed, fluctuations of the division speed due to changes in \( N^A_x \) are much smaller than the other way around. In other words, the growth speed is controlled mainly by \( N^A_y \).

4.2. PRESERVATION OF THE MINORITY MOLECULE

As another demonstration of control, we study a model in which there is more specific catalysis of molecule synthesis. Here, instead of single active molecule types for \( X \) and \( Y \), we consider a system with \( k \) types of active \( X \) and \( Y \) molecules, \( X^A(i) \) and \( Y^A(i) \) (\( i = 1, 2, \ldots, k \)). In this model, each active molecule type catalyses the synthesis of only a few types (\( m < k \)) of the other species of molecules. Graphically representing the ability for such catalysis using arrows as \( i_x \rightarrow j_y \) for \( X \rightarrow Y \) and \( i_y \rightarrow j_x \) for \( Y \rightarrow X \), the network of arrows defining the catalysing relations for the entire system is chosen randomly, and is fixed throughout each simulation. An example of
such a network (that which was used in the simulation discussed below) is shown in Fig. 7(a). Here, we assume that both $X$ and $Y$ molecules have the same “specificity” (i.e., the same value of $m$) and study how this symmetry is broken.

As discussed in Section 2, when $N_x$, $\gamma_x$, and $F$ satisfy the conditions necessary for the realization of a state in which $N_{X}^{i}$ is sufficiently small, the surviving cell type contains only a few active $Y$ molecules, while the number of inactive ones vanish or is very small. Our simulations show that in the present model with several active molecules types, only a single type of active $Y$ molecule remains after a sufficiently long time. We call this “surviving type”, $i$, ($1 \leq i \leq k$). In contrast, at least $m$ types of $X^A$ species, that can be catalysed by the remaining $Y^A$ molecule species remain. Accordingly, for a cell that survived after a sufficiently long time, a single type of $Y^A$ molecule catalyses the synthesis of (at least) $m$ kinds of $X$ molecule species, while the multiple types of $X$ molecules catalyse this single type of $Y^A$ molecules. Thus, the original symmetry with respect to the catalytic specificity is broken as a result of the difference between the synthesis speeds.

Due to autocatalytic reactions, there is a tendency for further increase of the molecules that are in the majority. This leads to competition for replication between molecule types of the same species. Since the total number of $Y$ molecules is small, this competition leads to all-or-none behavior for the survival of molecules. As a result, only a single type of species $Y$ remains, while for species $X$, the numbers of molecules of different types are statistically distributed as guaranteed by the uniform replication error rate.

The distribution of $X^A(i)$ species and the growth speed depend on the identity of the surviving type $i$, of $Y^A(i)$. In Fig. 7(b), we display long-time number distributions of $X^A(i)$ molecules obtained from six different initial configurations, with a gray-scale plot. The population distribution of $Y^A(i)$ molecules satisfies $N(Y^A(i)) \approx (2-6)$, and $N(Y^A(j)) \approx 0$ for $j \neq i$. The identity of the remaining type $i$, depends on the initial conditions. The number distribution of $X^A(i)$ and $X^I$ depends strongly on $i$, as shown in Fig. 7(b). This strong dependence is expected, since the $m$ types of $X$ molecules catalysed by each active type of $Y$ molecule differ, as determined by the catalytic network [Fig. 7(a)].

Although $X$ and $Y$ molecules catalyse each other, a change in the type of the remaining active $Y$ molecule has a much stronger influence on $X$ than a change in the types of the active $X$ molecules on $Y$, since the number of $Y$ molecules is much smaller. Consider, for example, a structural change of an active $Y$ molecule from type $i$, to $i'$ (for example, the change in polymer sequence)
that may occur during synthesis. If such a change occurs and remains, there will be a composition change from \( N(Y_{i}) \neq 0 \) to \( N(Y_{i}) = 0 \). This change will alter the distribution of \( X(i) \) drastically, as suggested by Fig. 7(b). By contrast, a structural change experienced by \( X \) molecules will have a much smaller influence on the distribution of \( Y(j) \). (This ignores the case in which many \( X \) molecules change to a same type simultaneously by replication error, resulting in a drastic change of the distribution of \( X \). Such a situation, however, is very rare in accordance with the law of large numbers.) In fact, there always remain some fluctuations in the distribution of \( X \) molecules, while the distribution of \( Y \) molecules (i.e., identity of the remaining type \( i_{r} \)) is fixed over many generations, until a rare structural change leads to a different remaining type, which may allow for a higher growth speed and the survival of the type containing it under selection.

With the results in Sections 3 and 4, we can conclude that the \( Y \) molecules, i.e., the minority species, control the behavior of the system, and are preserved well over many generations. We therefore call this state the minority-controlled (MC) state.

43. EVOLVABILITY OF THE MINORITY CONTROLLED STATE

An important characteristic of the MC state is evolvability. Consider a variety of active molecules, with different catalytic activities. Then, the synthesis rates \( \gamma_{x} \) and \( \gamma_{y} \) depend on the activities of the catalysing molecules. Thus, \( \gamma_{x} \) can be written in terms of the molecule's inherent growth rate, \( g_{x} \), and the activity, \( e_{x}(i) \), of the corresponding catalysing molecule \( Y(i) \):

\[
\gamma_{x} = g_{x} \times e_{x}(i), \quad \gamma_{y} = g_{y} \times e_{y}(i).
\]

Since such a biochemical reaction is entirely facilitated by catalytic activity, a change of \( e_{x} \) or \( e_{y} \), for example by the structural change of polymers, will be more important. Given the occurrence of such a change to molecules, those with greater catalytic activities will be selected through competition evolution, leading to the selection of larger \( e_{x} \) and \( e_{y} \). As an example to demonstrate this point, we have extended the model in Section 2 to include \( k \) kinds of active molecules with different catalytic activities. Then, molecules with greater catalytic activities are selected through competition.

Here, the minority controlled state is relevant to realize evolvability. Since only a few molecules of the \( Y \) species exist in the MC state, a structural change in them strongly influences the catalytic activity of the protocell. On the other hand, a change to \( X \) molecules has a weaker influence, on the average, since the deviation of the average catalytic activity caused by such a change is smaller, as can be deduced from the law of large numbers. Hence, the MC state is important for a protocell to realize evolvability.

5. Effect of Higher-order Catalysis

In the first toy model considered in this paper, in order to realize the MC state, the difference between the time scales of the two kinds of molecules often must be rather large. For example, the ratio \( \gamma_{y}/\gamma_{x} \) should typically be less than 0.05 when the number of molecules is in the range 500–2000. (If the number is larger, the rate should be much smaller.) This difference in growth rates required to realize the MC state is drastically reduced in a model that includes higher-order catalytic reaction processes in the replication of molecules.

Consider a replication of molecules described as follows:

\[
X + X' + Y \rightarrow 2X + X' + Y;
\]
\[
Y + Y' + X \rightarrow 2Y + Y' + X. \tag{2}
\]

In complex biochemical reaction networks, such higher-order catalytic reactions often exist. Indeed, proteins in a cell are catalysed not solely by nucleotides but with the collaboration of proteins and nucleotides. Nucleotides, similarly, are catalysed not solely by proteins but with the collaboration of nucleotides and proteins.

In the continuum limit, the rate equation corresponding to reaction (2) is given by

\[
\frac{dN_{x}}{dt} = \gamma_{x} N_{x}^{2} N_{y}^{A} N_{y}^{A} \quad \text{and} \quad \frac{dN_{y}}{dt} = \gamma_{y} N_{y}^{2} N_{x}^{A} N_{x}^{A}.
\]

In this higher-order catalytic reaction, it is expected that the difference between the numbers of \( X \) and \( Y \) molecules is amplified.
The main conclusion of this section is that, when we consider higher-order catalysis, the realization of the minority controlled state occurs for a wider range of values of $\gamma_Y/\gamma_X$. In the above example, a minority controlled state maintaining growth is realized for $0.7 < \gamma_Y/\gamma_X < 0.93$, while the former inequality is always satisfied as long as one considers a cell that continues to produce offspring.

6. Discussion

In this paper, we have shown that in a mutually catalysing system, molecules $Y$ with the slower synthesis speed tend to act as the carrier of heredity. Through the selection under reproduction, a state, in which there is a very small number of inactive $Y$ molecules, is selected. This state is termed the “minority controlled state”. Between the two molecule species, there appears to be a separation of roles, that with a larger number, and that with a greater catalytic activity. The former has a variety of chemicals and reaction paths, while the latter works as a basis for the heredity, in the sense of the two properties mentioned in the Introduction, “preservation” and “control”. We now discuss these properties in more detail.

*Preservation property*. A state that can be reached only through very rare fluctuations is selected, and it is preserved over many generations*. In the theory presented here, the selected and preserved state is one with $N_Y^a \approx 2 - 10$ and $N_Y^i \approx 0$. The realization of such a state is very rare when we consider the rate equation obtained in the continuum limit. For a model with several types of both molecule species, the type of active $Y$ molecules with non-zero population remains fixed, in spite of the process of stochastic fluctuations.

*Control property*. A change in the number of $Y$ molecules has a stronger influence on the growth rate of a cell than a change in the number of $X$ molecules. Also, a change in the catalytic activity of the $Y$ molecules has a strong influence on the growth of the cell. The catalytic activity

---

*Recall also the definition of the information by Shannon & Weaver (1949), according to which rarer events carry a greater amount of information.*
of the $Y$ molecules acts as a control parameter of the system. For a model with several types of each molecule species, $X$ (the majority species) has a smaller catalytic activity on the average, and its catalysis is rather specific, only acting in the synthesis of a single or a few types of molecules. The minority species $Y$ has a greater catalytic ability and acts to catalyse the synthesis of many kinds of molecules. Hence, a change in $Y$ has a very strong influence.

Once this minority controlled state is established, it is rather straightforward to assume the following scenario for the evolution of genetic information. First, a new evolutionary incentive, i.e. a new selection pressure is now possible to emerge, to evolve a machinery to ensure that the minority molecule makes it into the offspring cells, since otherwise the reproduction of the cell is highly damaged. Hence, a machinery to guarantee the faithful transmission of the minority molecule evolves. In other words, the origin of heredity is established. Note that this heredity can evolve before the appearance of any specific metabolic or genetic contents transmitted faithfully. This heredity evolves just as a result of kinetic phenomenon and is a rather general phenomenon in a reproducing protocell consisting of mutually catalytic molecules.

Once this faithful transmission of minority molecule is evolved, it provides a basis for critical information for the reproduction of the protocells. Since the molecule is well taken care of and is guaranteed to be transmitted, other chemicals that are synthesized in connection with it are probable to be transmitted, albeit not always faithfully. Hence, there appears a further evolutionary incentive to package life-critical information into the minority molecule. Now more information ("many bits" of information) are encoded on the minority molecule. Now, the molecule works as a carrier of genetic information in today's sense. With this evolution having more molecules catalysed by the minority molecule, it is then easier to further develop the machinery to better take care of minority molecules, since this minority molecule is essential to many reactions for the synthesis of many other molecules. Hence, the evolution of faithful transmission of minority molecules and of coding of more information reinforce each other. At this point, one can expect a separation of metabolism and genetic information.

To sum up, how a single molecule starts to reign the heredity is understood from a kinetic viewpoint. We first show the minority controlled state as a rather general consequence of the kinetic process of mutually catalytic molecules. This provides a basis for heredity. Taking advantage of the evolvability of minority controlled state, then, preservation mechanism of the minority molecule evolves, which allows for more information encoded on it, leading to the separation of genetic information and metabolism. In this sense, the minority molecule species with slower synthesis speed, leading to the preservation of rare states and control of the behavior of the system, acts as an information carrier. The important point of our theory is that heredity arises prior to any metabolic information that needs to be inherited.

Note that for the present theory for the origin of information, the existence of a cell unit that reproduces itself is required. Two levels of reproduction, both molecules and cells are assumed here. With the selection pressure for the reproduction of cells, there appears a state that is not expected by the rate equation for reaction of molecules, where the number of inactive $Y$ molecules that are parasitic to the catalytic reaction is suppressed. The relevance of this type of two-level reproduction to avoid molecule parasites is also discussed as a stochastic corrector model (Szathmary & Maynard Smith, 1997). In the present study, however, importance of cellular compartment for the origin of genetic information is more significant.

Finally, the following question remains: How does the difference in the catalytic activity necessary to realize the MC state generally come to exist? Of course, it is quite natural in a complex chemical system that there will be differences in synthesis speeds or catalytic activities, and, in fact, this is the case in the biochemistry of present-day organisms. Still, it would be preferable to have a theory describing the spontaneous divergence of synthesis speeds without assuming a difference in advance, to provide a general model of the possible "origin" of bio-information from any possible replication system.
To close the paper, we discuss (1) the evolutionary stability and (2) evolutionary realizability of the MC state.

One important consequence of the existence of the MC state is evolvability. Mutations introduced to the majority species tend to be cancelled out on the average, in accordance with the law of large numbers. Hence, the catalytic activity of the minority species (Y in our model) is not only sustained, but has a greater potentiality to increase through evolution.

Recently, there have been some experiments to construct minimal replicating systems in vitro. In particular, Matsuura et al. (2001) constructed a replication system of molecules including DNA polymerase, synthesized by the corresponding gene. Roughly speaking, the polymerase in the experiment corresponds to X in our model, while the polymerase gene corresponds to Y. In that experiment, instead of changing the synthesis speed \( \gamma_x \) or N, the influence of the number of genes is investigated.

In the experiment, it was found that replication is maintained even under deleterious mutations (that correspond to structural changes from active to inactive molecules in our model), only when the population of DNA polymerase genes is small and competition of replicating systems is applied. When the number of genes (corresponding to Y) is small, the information contained in the DNA polymerase genes is preserved. This is made possible by the maintenance of rare fluctuations, as found in our study.

As discussed in Section 4, a change in catalytic activity can be included in the model by considering a system with several kinds of active molecules with different activities. By considering a mutation form \( X^A(i) \) to \( X^A(j) \) (or \( Y^A(i) \) to \( Y^A(j) \)), accompanied by a change in the value of \( e_x \) (or \( e_y \)), one can examine the stability of the MC state with respect to mutation. If the initial difference between the catalytic abilities \( e_x \) and \( e_y \) (and other parameters) satisfies the conditions stated in Section 3, the MC state is realized. Then, we examined if such a state is destroyed by a change in the catalytic activities of molecules. We found that this difference is in fact maintained over many generations and that the MC state continues to exist. This behavior is due to the fact that a small mutation of \( Y \) strongly influences the synthesis of \( X \), and a mutation resulting in a decrease of \( e_y \) is not selected. Hence, the MC state possesses evolutionary stability.

The final remaining question that we wish to address is regarding the realizability of the MC state in the situation that initially the two molecule species have almost the same catalytic activity. One may expect that there would occur a divergence of the catalytic activities of two such molecule species, because once one species (say \( Y \)) has a larger catalytic activity, the number of \( X \) molecules will increase. This results in \( Y \) becoming the minority species, which implies that its influences on the behavior of the cell will become stronger. For this reason, the catalytic activity of \( Y \) increases faster than that of \( X \), and thus the replication speed of \( X \) becomes larger. In this way, the difference between replication speeds of \( X \) and \( Y \) might become further amplified.

While the above argument seems reasonable, it does not hold for our model. In simulations including such a structural change, we have not observed such spontaneous symmetry breaking with regard to the growth speeds of the two species, when these species initially have (almost) equal catalytic activities. The reason is as follows. In our model, the division of a cell is assumed to occur when the total number of molecules becomes double the original number. Now, in the model, the collision of two molecules is assumed to occur randomly. Hence, the probability for a collision leading to the synthesis of molecules should be proportional to \( \gamma_x N_x N_y + \gamma_y N_x N_y \), if we assume a constant proportionality between the numbers of active and inactive molecule. Then, note that the quantity \( N_x N_y \propto N_x (N - N_x) \) has a peak at \( N_x = N_y \). It follows that the growth speed should be maximal when the numbers of the two species are equal. Hence, there is a tendency toward a state in which there are equal numbers of both species. Of course, this argument is rather rough, due to the assumption concerning the ratio of active to inactive molecule numbers, and the existence of a peak at exactly \( N_x = N_y \) may be slightly modified. However, the basic idea here is correct, and there is undoubtedly a tendency toward equal numbers. For this reason, a state with a large difference is not reached spontaneously through some kind of symmetry breaking.
There are some possible scenarios within which the above-described tendency toward equal growth speeds may be ineffective.

1. Higher-order catalysis. As mentioned in Section 4, the imbalance necessary to realize an MC state is much smaller when higher-order catalysis is considered. Indeed, by introducing the mutation of catalytic activity to the model studied in Section 4, we have sometimes observed spontaneous symmetry breaking between the parameters characterizing the two species. The resulting state with a sufficient difference between the growth speeds of two species, however, does not last very long, since the necessary imbalance between $\gamma_x$ and $\gamma_y$ is so small that mutation can reverse the relative sizes of $\gamma_x$ and $\gamma_y$.

2. Change in the collision condition**. In our model, collisions of molecules occur randomly. Hence, if the number of $X$ molecules is larger, most collisions occur between two $X$ molecules, and no reaction occurs. However, if molecules are arranged spatially under different conditions (e.g. consider the case in which $X$ molecules are on a membrane and $Y$ molecules are in a contained medium), then the number of reaction events between $X$ and $Y$ molecules can be increased. If we include this type of physical arrangement, which is rather natural when considering a cell, the tendency toward equal numbers no longer exists, and the divergence of growth speeds in molecules should occur.

3. Condition of growth. We have assumed that the division of the protocell occurs when the total number of molecules doubles. This assumption is useful as a minimal abstract model, but it may be more natural to have a threshold that depends on the number of molecules of one species (or, more generally, of some subset of all species), rather than the total number. For example, consider the case in which division occurs when the size of a membrane synthesized by biochemical reactions is larger than some threshold. This condition, for example, could be modeled by stipulating that division occurs when the number

of molecules of one species, say $X$, that composes the membrane, is larger than some threshold value. By imposing this type of division condition, the tendency toward equal numbers of $X$ and $Y$ molecules could be avoided, and the divergence of the replication speeds of $X$ and $Y$ could take place.

4. Network structure. The catalytic network in a cell is generally quite complex, with many molecules participating in mutual catalysis for replication. The evolution of replication systems with such catalytic networks have been studied since the proposal of the hypercycle by Eigen & Schuster (1979). Dyson (1985), on the other hand, obtained a condition for loose reproduction of protocells with complex reaction networks consisting of active and inactive molecules. The origin of recursive replication from such loose reproduction is also discussed (Segre et al., 2000).

The differentiation of cells with a catalytic reaction network has also been studied (Kaneko & Yomo, 1997, 1999; Furusawa & Kaneko, 1998). Here, it has been found that chemicals with low concentrations are often important in differentiation. If the total number of molecules participating in the reaction network is small, there should generally exist some species whose numbers of molecules are small, and the discrete nature of these numbers plays a significant role. For example, Togashi & Kaneko (2001) have found novel symmetry breaking that appears in a catalytic reaction system with a small total number of molecules. Furthermore, a preliminary study of the reaction network version of the model considered in this paper reveals spontaneous symmetry breaking that distinguishes a few controlling molecule species from a large number of non-controlling species, without assuming a difference in synthesis speeds.

The symmetry breaking by the network structure is related with the evolution of specificity. Although we have studied catalysis that has no specificity (except for the model considered in Section 4.2), in reality one type of molecule can catalyse the synthesis of only a limited number of molecule species. Interestingly, a preliminary study shows a symmetry breaking with regard to the roles of molecules (with equal synthesis speeds) when higher-order catalytic reactions (as

** Since scenarios 2 and 3 assume another kind of symmetry breaking between $X$ and $Y$ (albeit being different from the synthesis speeds), they cannot provide the final solution to the true spontaneous symmetry breaking, although the assumptions may be biologically reasonable.
in Section 5) in random networks with catalytic specificity are included.

The authors would like to thank Shin‘ichi Sasa and Takashi Ikegami for useful discussions. They are also grateful to Walter Fontana for illuminating comments and suggestions to improve the manuscript. This research was supported by Grants-in-Aid for Scientific Research from the Ministry of Education, Science and Culture of Japan (11CE2006, 11837004).

REFERENCES


